

CASE STUDY

2003

TÁ REBOCADO

Development Community Program

Salvador – BA



**CAIXA Program
for Best Practices in
Local Management**



CAIXA



UN-HABITAT

Case Study prepared by the Brazilian Institute for Municipal Administration (IBAM) for the Federal Savings Bank (Caixa Econômica Federal) under the CAIXA Program for Best Practices in Local Management

PRESIDENT OF REPUBLIC
Luiz Inácio Lula da Silva

MINISTER OF FINANCE
Antônio Palocci

FEDERAL SAVINGS BANK (CAIXA ECONÔMICA FEDERAL)

PRESIDENT
Jorge Eduardo Levi Mattoso

VICE PRESIDENT FOR URBAN DEVELOPMENT AND GOVERNMENT – VIURB
Aser Cortines Peixoto Filho

DIRECTOR OF PARTNERSHIPS AND SUPPORT FOR URBAN DEVELOPMENT – DIDUP
Jorge Luiz de Souza Arraes

NATIONAL SERVICES MANAGER FOR URBAN DEVELOPMENT – GEURB
Beatriz Loureiro Cerqueira Lima

SALVADOR BUSINESS OFFICE SUPERINTENDENT
Samuel Rocha

GIDUR/REDUR MANAGER
Mário Sérgio de Oliveira Baptista

BRAZILIAN INSTITUTE FOR MUNICIPAL ADMINISTRATION

SUPERVISION
Marlene Fernandes

COORDINATION
Carlos Alberto Silva Arruda

ASSISTANTS
Bianca Coelho Nogueira
Patrícia Azevedo de Oliveira

ELABORATION OF THE CASE STUDY
Débora Gershon

REVISION
Cláudia Ajúz

TRANSLATION
Christopher Peterson

LAYOUT
CLAN Design

March de 2003

GERSHON, Débora

Case Study: TÁ REBOCADO – development community program, Salvador – BA / Débora Gershon. Supervision, Marlene Fernandes. Coordination, Carlos Alberto Silva Arruda. – Rio de Janeiro: IBAM/CAIXA, 2003.

54 p.; 21,0 x 29,7cm

1. Popular housing – Salvador (BA). 2. Political housing – Salvador (BA). I. Fernandes, Marlene (Sup.). II. Arruda, Carlos Alberto Silva (Coord.). III. Instituto Brasileiro de Administração Municipal. IV. Caixa Econômica Federal.

728 (CDD 15.ed.)

Presentation by CAIXA

This CASE STUDY is part of a series of publications which aims to publicize the ten award-winning experiences by "Caixa Best Practices in Local Management Program" correspondent to the 2001/2002 cycle. The main objective of this series is to provide deeper evaluation of the award-winning practices, allowing other Municipalities, that are interested to develop similar initiatives, to identify and to get out the maximum of the subsidies from those successful projects.

In this publication, we present the TAREBOCADO practice. This is a community development program, developed by Pracatum Association for Social Action, located in Candeal Neighborhood, in the city of Salvador-BA. The actions of the program are aimed at fostering the development of the Candeal community, contributing to the community's appropriation of specific tools and skills to ensure sustainability and self-management of the process. The impact and the excellent results of the experience, were the cause of the classification between 100 best practices of the world, in the context held by the Dubai International Award for Best Practices to Improve the Living Environment, constituting in reference for others institutions.

The CAIXA has as a mission to promote the continuing improvement of the living conditions in our society, intermediating resources and financial business, acting as a priority in the encouragement of the urban development, therefore, in housing, sanitation and infrastructure, and in the management of funds, programs and social services. As one of its action strategies, it is important to highlight that CAIXA establishes partnerships with other institutions, in order to obtain a high quality product.

With that commitment we are looking for, through this publication, to disseminate the Brazilian Best Practices that we are supporting/financing and, overall contributing to the improvement of the social polices in our country.

Other important publications for your city and community could be find at the website: www.caixa.gov.br, download option.

Aser Cortines

Vice-President of Urban Development and Government

Jorge Mattoso

President of CAIXA

Presentation by the Executive Director of United Nations Program for Human Settlements, UN-Habitat

I am pleased to present a series of case studies and guidelines on lessons learned from Brazilian Best Practices. The Habitat Agenda, adopted in June 1996, calls for the documentation and analysis of best practices as one of the principal means of monitoring conditions, trends and emerging policy responses. Since then, the international community has called upon UN-Habitat and its partners to apply lessons learned from best practices as a basis for capacity building and decentralized co-operation through the exchange of knowledge, expertise and experience.

The Brazilian Federal Savings Bank (CAIXA) and the Brazilian Institute for Municipal Administration (IBAM) are demonstrating their leadership role in this endeavour. As partners of UN-Habitat's Best Practices and Local Leadership Program, they are providing the Latin American and Caribbean region, as well as other regions, with valuable lessons learned from experience.

The in-depth analysis of the TÁ REBOCADO experience, which was designated by UN-Habitat as a global best practice in 2002, should be of particular interest to all those involved in the implementation of the Millennium Development Goals. It provides insights to addressing the issues of sustainable urbanization, poverty reduction, and the improvement of the living conditions of the urban poor.

It demonstrates that the strategic objectives of the Habitat Agenda – namely partnerships and participation, decentralization and capacity building – can be applied in a holistic manner to bring tangible and lasting benefits to people and their communities. It also demonstrates that sustainable development is increasingly dependent upon addressing the issues of the urbanization, good urban governance, and access to land, shelter and basic services by the urban poor. To this end, the case studies and guidelines provide Habitat Agenda partners around the world with pointers for the future.

Anna Kajamulo Tibaijuka

Under-Secretary-General

United Nations Programme for Human Settlements

Presentation

In 1999, the Brazilian Federal Savings Bank (Caixa Econômica Federal) established the CAIXA Program for Best Practices in Local Management, aimed at the domestic, regional, and international dissemination of projects implemented with its technical and financial support, as well as the transferability of those that qualified as good and best practices in local management. The initiative is part of the effort by the Brazilian government to support the implementation of the Habitat Agenda in the country through participation in the *"Best Practices and Local Leadership Program"* (BLP) and in the Global Award for Excellence in Best Practices, sponsored every two years by the Dubai Municipality in collaboration with the United Nations Human Settlements Program (UN Habitat).

According to the Program Guidelines, every two years, and based on an evaluation by an independent jury, CAIXA is responsible for awarding the ten best practices registered in its data bank, which are submitted subsequently as contestants for the above-mentioned Dubai Award.

The success achieved by the Program (crowned by the awards in the years 2000 and 2002) has confirmed the great interest in Brazil in learning about successful experiences in sustainable local development. In order to respond to this interest, CAIXA has expanded the Program's scope and the accumulated data base.

Preparation of the current case study on the "Tá Rebocado" Community Development Program¹ conducted by the Pracatum Association for Social Action (APAS) in partnership with other public and private institutions is the result of this need to improve and present key criteria and variables to facilitate the understanding and transferability of different experiences.

The case study presented here is organized in chapters aimed at characterizing the Project, its implementation process (including institutional difficulties faced by Pracatum in consolidating the Project and an annotated description of the negotiations involved in establishing strategic partnerships) – chapters 3 and 4; followed by a critical analysis of key variables for evaluating the experience and fostering its transferability – chapter 5.

Note that the variables used here are in line with those suggested in the

¹ Program classified by CAIXA as one of the ten Best Practices in Brazil in 2001.

Term of Reference prepared by IBAM for overall orientation in the analysis of different Practices.

The case study concludes with Chapter 6, focusing on overall remarks and fundamental elements for sharing and potentially transferring the Project's experience. The research methodology used to prepare this study and a list of field interviews are provided in an appendix at the end of the document.

Several factors impacted the production of this study: a) since the Practice is still under way, and due to the promoting institution's difficulty in developing a systematic and formal evaluation process for the Project, several documents were consulted that sometimes referred to activities and resources that were difficult to compare; b) in addition, the lack of any previous external evaluation of the Project in Candeal made the use of primary sources particularly important, thus providing this study with its unique flavor.

Table of Contents

1- Design and Characteristics of the "Tá Rebocado" Project	9
2- Implementation Process	14
3- The Project According to Strategic Analytical Variables	25
3.1- Partnerships – the role and performance of partner institutions	25
3.2- Impacts – analysis and evaluation of results and impacts	26
3.3- Sustainability	32
3.4- Community leadership and empowerment	34
3.5- Gender and social inclusion	36
4- Final Remarks	38
Bibliography	41
Appendices	
I- Abbreviations	44
II- Project Identification Card	45
III- Methodology	49
IV- Interviewees According to Institutional Affiliation/Focal Groups Conducted .	52
V- Photograph Report	54

Institution Responsible for the Case Study

Instituto Brasileiro de Administração Municipal – IBAM

Largo do IBAM, nº 1 – Humaitá – Rio de Janeiro – RJ – Brazil

ZIP Code: 22271-070

Phone: 55-21-25369797 – Fax: 55-21-25381613

E-mail: ibam@ibam.org.br

Internet: www.ibam.org.br

Background

Located in the city of Salvador, Bahia, Brazil, in an enclave measuring some 13.63 hectares (some 34 acres) surrounded by a middle-class area, the neighborhood of Candéal, belonging to the historical parish of Our Lady of Brotas, founded in 1718, was characterized until recently by highly disorganized land occupation, low income levels, and high illiteracy and unemployment rates, along with a highly dynamic cultural milieu.

Candéal descends directly from a *"quilombo"* (a slave haven or maroon community) dating to the 18th century, with more intense occupation occurring during the 20th century, similar to a semi-rural community, rooted in kinship ties that have fostered the transmission of characteristic customs and a cultural legacy giving the community its unique identity.

However, like other low-income communities in Brazil, Candéal de Brotas, already characterized by substandard housing and deficient basic infrastructure, underwent an intense process of marginalization in recent years as the result of urban sprawl, a limited supply of formal jobs, increasing unemployment and a burgeoning housing deficit, among other factors. The old Roça dos Neves subdivision and a handful of existing irregular housing units were joined by more recent illegal squatting, thus including Candéal among the numerous so-called Brazilian *"favelas"* or slums. However, the term *"favela"* is heavily rejected by the local community (including the more recent residents), who highlight the area's explicitly assumed and propagated cultural identity as opposed to the slum stigma based exclusively on socioeconomic conditions and territorialization.

In the quest to overcome the exclusion experienced by the 5,500 residents of Candéal, world-renowned musician Carlinhos Brown, born and raised in the community, launched the process which became the Pracatum Association for Social Action (APAS). Founded in 1994 with the primary objective of formalizing work relations among the so-called *"timbaleiros"*, a musical group founded by Carlinhos Brown himself, the Pracatum Association, a nonprofit civil society organization, immediately took charge of implementing programs and actions aimed at fostering the development of the Candéal community and contributing to the community's

appropriation of specific tools and skills to ensure sustainability and self-management of the process [translator's note: "*Pracatum*" is an onomatopoeic term for the "*timbalada*" drumbeats].

The proposal responsible for turning this initial goal into a political and social Practice began with two interdependent projects, founded on the concept that valuing community-based culture and educational processes was the only way to promote development in keeping with the local population's way of life, in such a way that the community could seize and lead the process. The two projects consisted of building and launching the Music Training School and the development of the "Tá Rebocado" Project, whose specific objectives were the improvement of community housing and infrastructure and an additional four lines of action: education and culture, health and environment, employment and income generation, and community organization [translator's note: "Tá Rebocado" is a local Bahian interjection that emphatically expresses veracity, roughly translatable as "That's the Honest Truth!". In the Project's context the name is also a play on words, since reboco in Portuguese means "stucco", thus alluding to the housing improvements introduced by the Project].

Thus, to develop these two projects, which were inseparably in charge of the mission ascribed to the new institution, i.e., that of improving quality of life for Candeal residents through a participatory community development program, a community base was established to guarantee the appropriateness and legitimacy of the actions taken by Pracatum.

In 1996, two years after the institution was formally founded, community assemblies² began to be organized to provide social and political backing for the proposals drafted within the Governing Council (whose members had been named by Carlinhos Brown) and the technical team initially contacted to design and implement the pedagogical proposal.

The above-mentioned action lines in the "Tá Rebocado" Project were defined by establishing this channel for dialogue with the community and by systematizing and analyzing the results of a community census conducted in 1997 to provide a better social portrait of the community and provide subsequent subsidies for the actions (given that the corresponding census data from the Brazilian National Census Bureau, IBGE, encompassed in the same sector not only the low-income Candeal community but also one of the areas with the highest purchasing power in the city of Salvador, i.e., the middle and upper-middle class area surrounding the Candeal neighborhood).

The community census covered 95% of the households in Candeal and was funded by Carlinhos Brown's recording company and the POMMAR-USAID Institute, with information gathered through door-to-door interviews. The questionnaire answered by the local population included 106 questions, thus

² The community assembly meetings, held weekly from 1997 to 2001, will be analyzed in greater depth during the discussion of the implementation of the Practice and the description of community organization activities.

resulting in some 100 thousand possible data for cross-analysis and marking the start of the "Tá Rebocado" Project in the community.³

The Project implementation is currently beginning the third and final stage, according to the schedule.

The "Tá Rebocado" Project

According to the interviews, the "Tá Rebocado" Project, consisting of urban renewal combined with a pedagogical proposal – elaborated at the time by the Pracatum team – was planned to begin after the construction and six months of operation of the Music Training School. Meanwhile, when Carlinhos Brown inaugurated the Candyall Guetho Square, a privately owned cultural and entertainment center for artistic events and specifically for rehearsals by Grupo Timbalada, he anticipated the start of the Project by making an informal request to the public authorities attending the inauguration to release funds for legalization of land ownership in Candeal – especially the lots located in a squatting area around the Roça dos Neves subdivision. As a result of this request, negotiations began between Pracatum and the government to begin drafting an intervention project, discussed and complemented by the community during the above-mentioned assemblies.

Implementation of the five lines of action – Housing/Urbanization and Infrastructure, Education and Culture, Employment and Income, Health, and Community Organization – included the following plans:

- Improvement of existing housing units (161 sanitation units and 480 other improvements);
- Initial construction 150 new housing units, distributed in separate areas and in the Sapucaia, Zé Botinha, Cidade Jardim, and Vila do Candeal housing projects;
- Construction of various types of community equipment and facilities;
- Expansion of water supply, sewage, and public lighting systems;
- Installation of a storm sewer system;
- Restructuring of the street layout;
- Implementation of environmental education programs and training of community health agents;

³ Based on the interviews, much of the computerized database on the initial stage of the "Tá Rebocado" Project (including the data bank from the local Candeal census) was lost; all that was left was a set of print documents with part of the data.

- Implementation of activities aimed at employment and income generation in the community; and
- Actions and strategies aimed at community organization and empowerment.

The funds released at the time by the first and subsequent partners in the Project – Caixa Econômica Federal (CAIXA) and the Government of the State of Bahia (represented by CONDER) were not sufficient to conclude all the actions demanded by the community during the assemblies and resulting from the evaluation of the local Candeal census data. The priority thus became the construction work included in the Housing/Urban Upgrading and Infrastructure component, while continuing to raise funds from other sources to meet the collectively defined demands.

Over the course of the Project, the third stage of which is scheduled to begin in February 2003, other partners joined the Practice, adding not only a new volume of funds employed in Candeal but also additional content in the action lines.

Of the actions previously planned, as explained in the item "Components and Summary of the Actions Planned in the Project" (see Appendix), the following have still not been implemented:

- Functioning of the Health Post;
- Construction of the Children's Center (daycare center and primary school);
- Construction of the Candeal Cultural and Trade Center;
- Construction of the Micro Business Center;
- Construction of the Sapucaia soccer field;
- Construction of semi-industrial production centers, focused on the music industry, recording, and production of props;
- Renovation of the Tamarineiro Square;
- Renovation of the Francisco Romana Square;
- Construction of new public squares;
- Recovery of Fonte do Governo; or
- Renovation and expansion of the AMFOGO headquarters.

The justification and impacts relating to the non-implementation of the above actions are described in Item 3.2 – Impacts: Analysis and Evaluation of Results and Impacts.

Activities involving employment and income generation and empowering community organization were especially characterized by the intervention of new

institutions in "Tá Rebocado", particularly the Association to Support Training through Solidarity, UNIPAZ, the Committee for the Democratization of Information Technology, the Federal University of Bahia, and SEBRAE (the Brazilian Service to Support Small and Medium-Sized Businesses).

2

Implementation Process

The history of Pracatum: the obstacles and their impact

As mentioned previously, the "Tá Rebocado" Project began ahead of schedule due to the newfound visibility of the Candéal community during the inauguration of the Candyall Guetho Square entertainment center. Thus, together with the launching of the Pracatum Association, the implementation of activities capable of providing it with political and social sustainability, and the elaboration of a pedagogical proposal to back the Association's development work, an inter-institutional negotiation process began to plan integrated intervention, although this fact was not associated with either the organizational maturation of the Association itself or the availability of a technical team with the numerical force or skills required for implementing the initial plans.

The Pracatum Association had just been founded, and at that point the implementation of the decision-making spheres comprising the policy framework of a nongovernmental organization (Governing Council and General Assembly) were still just formal instruments that demanded greater attention and investment by the founders. Membership in the Governing Council had been defined as two-third from amongst Candéal residents (to be named by the institution's lifetime president, Carlinhos Brown) and one-third from representatives of other areas and institutions in Salvador who had proven sympathetic to the Association's proposals and who could facilitate Candéal's inclusion on the city's agenda. Based on the field interviews, it appears that the Governing Council did not initially undergo a process of maturation capable of guaranteeing its links to the recently-created institution or its primary decision-making role (to intervene in actions by the Pracatum Association).

The community assemblies, whose role was to orient actions taken by the Governing Council, began by focusing more on the definition of actions in the specifically scheduled project rather than on institutional cohesion and a clear definition of the institution's mission. The fact that the actions scheduled in partnership with CAIXA and CONDER were launched ahead of schedule, although welcomed by the community as a pleasant surprise, produced an unexpected effect by turning what was intended as an assembly in the Pracatum Association into an

arena devoted to exposing demands and claims and defining specific lines of action for the "Tá Rebocado" Project. Although this process was considered as an inestimable conquest by the Project team and the local community, in relation to exercising and applying participatory practices and implementing a methodology capable of providing the Project with unequivocal legitimacy, the impacts on the recently-founded institution and the local population's view of it did not emerge as indicators of similar success.

INTERVIEW

"Analyzing the process, one realizes that it was all wrong. The founders were the self-proclaimed [Governing] Council members; there was no election. If you were a founder, you were [automatically] a Council member. No General Assembly was set up as the institution's top decision-making sphere. The assembly consists of the founding members, who are the Council members. These individuals occupy three different tiers under the bylaws. So it's a kind of absolute power...This scenario had a huge impact on the institution's work. The lack of a General Assembly could have turned Pracatum into an extremely authoritarian agency. This ended up not happening, but only because another assembly was created – the community assembly – which provided legitimacy for the institution's actions..."

However, the juxtaposition of roles by the assemblies hindered the population's grasp of the role to be played by Pracatum itself – sometimes revered as an arm of the public powers in the community and other times linked exclusively to the community leader in charge of the institution, reducing its power as an organization sustaining the overall work of Pracatum. In addition, the direct link between the assemblies and the demands and proposals of the "Tá Rebocado" Project resulted in a decrease in community participation in this decision-making arena, in light of the progressive transformation of demands raised by the assemblies into actions implemented by "Tá Rebocado" and the community's widespread view that this decision-making space had nothing more to offer.

In addition, the institution's technical staff (at the time consisting only of a group of teachers and technical advisors in charge of elaborating a curriculum for the Music Training School and a cross-cutting pedagogical proposal for the entire Association) was not sufficient for the needs foreseen in the forthcoming Project, thus requiring the hiring of a new group of professionals with different backgrounds, even before the funds could be disbursed by CAIXA in partnership with CONDER.

The results of the combination of these unforeseen events included:

- Estrangement between local residents and the dynamics of the Pracatum mission in practice;

- The redirecting of the assembly's role and the resulting lack of a top decision-making sphere capable of defining the new institution's direction;
- The hiring of a team of architects, sociologists, historians, and statisticians to assemble the Project, but who after the local census was conducted (for which the funds had already been secured) ended up abandoning the Association together with a major share of the teachers hired to design the Music Training School, notwithstanding the personal reasons alleged at the time;
- Dismantling of the initial "Tá Rebocado" team and a drastic reduction in the staff that was to be involved in the Project's implementation (for a year the team consisted of only two members, and currently consists of a sanitation engineer, an adult literacy teacher, a young community organizer, and a secretary, the latter two both residents of Candeal); and finally;
- Internal dissociation between the institution's two interdependent projects – the Music School and the urbanization project. According to the field interviews, this dissociation was further aggravated by the adoption of a new organizational format which, in the attempt to better operationalize the projects under way, established specific individual coordinators for each, replacing the previously defined management-sharing format. However, systematic meetings between the two coordinators and the overall direction of Pracatum – proposed as an alternative to ensure an ongoing dialogue between the two projects and to associate their respective activities with the so-called institutional mission and a single pedagogical proposal – failed to constitute privileged spaces for joint planning, given the constant juxtaposition of administrative and financial issues with those pertaining to the program content and the instruments aimed at community mobilization per se.

Therefore, this legacy in the Pracatum Association, dating to when it began functioning, namely a break between the action-formulating processes in the Music School and the urban renewal project, resulted in an estrangement between the two teams, additionally impacting the constitution of the assemblies, which were demobilized in 2002, precisely as a result of the assessment that their role had been distorted. When the pertinence of the assemblies was evaluated by the team, meetings with local leaders were organized as an alternative to the lack of a more expanded forum for debate, evaluation, and definition of criteria for the Project's continuation.

It should also be mentioned that the Governing Council has not met since June 2002, because the institution's executive direction evaluated that the Council was experiencing difficulty in understanding its role, often assuming the function of merely interfering in what were simply institutional administrative and routine daily matters. The interviews held with members of this Council (all Candeal residents) revealed a concern over the lack of definition in the Council's role, but also the persistence of questions about the way the Council had been set up and the possibility that duties had been delegated to other decision-making spheres, purportedly capable of stripping the Council of its power.

An institutional strategic planning process was conducted in late 2002, identifying the difficulties currently faced by the Association – and the object of a forthcoming intervention by the head team: "*...lack of an active role by the Council; lack of an articulated, shared vision by the coordinating body concerning the organization's future; and fragmentation of the organization into two separate programs*".⁴

Of course one cannot state categorically that there was a cause-and-effect relationship between the fact that the "Tá Rebocado" Project was launched ahead of schedule and the subsequent difficulties and restructuring discussed above, but one can at least infer that the simultaneity of the processes of institutional maturation and implementation of large-scale works and projects posed an additional challenge for managing an institution, "*that was already born oversized*"⁵ and for conducting a specific, multi-sectoral project that was intended to unfold through a process of permanent construction and renewal.

The institutionalization of partnerships

Initial remarks

The Project is characterized by permanent local and non-local partnerships and others referred to provisionally as temporary partnerships. As explained previously, the neighborhood associations, CAIXA, and the Government of the State of Bahia/CONDER were the first partners in the "Tá Rebocado" Project, participating in it from the onset. The Municipality of Salvador and other municipal agencies, the Association to Support Training with Solidarity, UNIPAZ, the Committee for the Democratization of Information Technology, the UEC English course, and SEBRAE were involved in the Practice through non-systematic interventions (related to the employment and income generation proposal), except for SEBRAE, which was active for a longer period of time through implementation of the PRODER-URBANO Program, described later in this report.

Negotiations with CAIXA and State Government/CONDER

a) Consolidation of the partnership

The negotiation process with CAIXA and CONDER began with extensive participation by leader Carlinhos Brown, who was largely responsible for the

⁴ Excerpts from document on Institutional Strategic Planning, prepared through a consultancy by JohnSnowBrasil Consultants.

⁵ Excerpt from one of the field interviews.

fundraising inside the institution and the initial mediation between the Project team and the above-mentioned financial and technical partners. Applications for and signing of contracts and agreements were all done with this leader's presence, given his widespread legitimacy and visibility among both institutions and residents of Salvador.

Having made the initial contact with CAIXA, the newly-designed Project was submitted by both parties to the agencies under the Government of the State of Bahia/CONDER in order for the latter to assume responsibility for the promotion and direct supervision of the Project, beginning with the loan made by CAIXA and the offer of matching funds by the State, whose percentage varied according to the types and sources of funds to be utilized.

According to the interviews with the two above-mentioned agencies and Pracatum, no institutional architecture was set up to take responsibility for the actual integration between the three initial partners, with the local association sometimes taking informal responsibility for such mediation. At specific moments involving the release of installments to guarantee continuity in the actions, CONDER and CAIXA assumed a central role in the process, forwarding information to the Pracatum technical team.

However, institutionalization of the partnership between the three organizations eventually led to the mobilization of formal instruments for interlocution and evaluation, expressed as contractual obligations such as: the submission of monthly reports by Pracatum to CAIXA and CONDER; monthly visits by CAIXA to the community to guarantee the quality of the public construction works; and constant inspection by CONDER, responsible for the direct monitoring of the construction work.

Based on the field interviews and observation of the activities completed to date, although the lack of an integrated channel for operationalizing and dynamizing the partnerships has not necessarily produced a negative impact on the development of the Practice, it appears that if such a channel had been created it would have helped minimize the following:

- Juxtaposition of roles in the work by CAIXA and CONDER, given that both institutions are responsible for monitoring and inspecting the activities in Candéal, although with different degrees of intensity;
- Lack of flexibility in the operational procedures for releasing installments by CAIXA in light of the needs imposed by the characteristic dynamics of a Project developed in communities identified by irregular land occupation and the nature of the contractors hired for construction work (who generally lack sufficient working capital to maintain their activities during delays in the disbursement of funds);
- Difficulty in the effective integration and totalization of actions financed and supported separately by these various stakeholders, given that CONDER, in addition to the matching funds offered, signed specific contracts and agreements

with Pracatum aimed at developing employment and income generation activities⁶; and

- Reproduction of this scenario during intervention by other institutions in Candéal.

To overcome such difficulties in the implementation of planned actions and optimization of decision-making time, it was decided to hold meetings, which despite being asystematic, helped accommodate the Project to the technical requirements and expectations of these important funding and promotional agencies. In addition, the technical staff provided both by CAIXA (several engineers and 2 social workers) and CONDER (2 public works inspectors, 1 coordinator, 1 head inspector, 1 assistant manager, and 1 social worker) proved to be a significant success factor for the Practice.

Since CONDER was responsible for direct intervention in the Project's implementation, it is important that the staff it provided helped avoid interruption of the social work even after the construction work was concluded. Based on a request submitted by Pracatum to CONDER, the social worker conducted her activities full-time in the APAS, helping foster closer relations between CONDER and the Candéal community in general and promoting the development and management of actions and activities launched by Pracatum.

The result of this effort by the social worker proved so successful in relation to the initial objectives that it became necessary to ensure that a potential personalization of her role would not override her institutional representation. Due to the social worker's natural and virtually unavoidable involvement in other actions and projects developed in the area and the accelerated dynamics adopted by such projects to materialize the proposed actions and minimize their unforeseen effects, a difficulty emerges in maintaining the links between the professional provided by the institution and the promoting organization. The considerable increase in the intervals between the meetings held to define technical and policy guidelines and to exchange information (a periodicity replaced merely by the submission of monthly technical reports) was one indicator cited to illustrate the current distance in the relationship.

b) Indication of resources and deadlines

As already demonstrated in the item on fundraising, the resources employed by CAIXA and CONDER corresponded to nearly all of the funds earmarked for intervention in Candéal, in the form of construction of housing units, replacement of those identified as substandard and unhealthy, expansion of the sewerage, storm sewer, and public lighting systems, and construction of a Health Post, all actions that were scheduled in three stages.

The intervention project was submitted to CAIXA in late 1997 and the

⁶ Resources from these contracts were used for handicrafts courses, production of candles and soaps, courses in culinary arts, etc.

construction work began in April 1999, with resources coming from the Pro-Moradia /FGTS Fund (to finance housing) and the Federal Budget, whose use was limited to infrastructure works.

Due to the delay in the release of Federal Budget funds-in-grant for the project, an agreement had to be reached between the teams to reallocate part of the funds from the Pro-Moradia Program, previously earmarked for experimental refinishing of both the new and improved housing units in order to meet infrastructure demands.⁷ Although, based on the available documents, it was not possible to identify the amount of funds reallocated. According to the partners involved in the project, this fact did not have a negative impact on the development of the Practice since all the targets were met, although the architectural and finishing innovations that had originally been planned were not fully executed.

All of the funds employed by these agencies were administered by CAIXA, except for those invested in the social area, the management of which was transferred to Pracatum under the auspices of the promoting agency, CONDER. Of the 1 million dollars⁸ invested in Candéal, approximately US \$ 48,300.00⁹ (forty eight thousand and three hundred dollars), were transferred directly to APAS.

In order to implement the third stage of the Project, a total of US \$ 448,330.00¹⁰ (four hundred forty eight thousand and three hundred thirty dollars), has already been requested from CONDER to make improvements on 300 housing units, build 12 new units, and implement the "Cultural Corridor" Project. The latter aims to support cultural production enterprises in Candéal by renovating the traditional alleys and stairways, installing more sophisticated public lighting, setting up commercial establishments along the Corridor, and building stages for concerts by the students from the Music Training School and other artists and entertainers from the community.

The third stage of this construction work is scheduled to end in March 2004. It is important that for the Pracatum management, implementation of the Cultural Corridor means the concrete possibility of resuming the integration between the institution's two basic projects.

According to CONDER, the source of the funds for this new undertaking has still not been established. It is necessary to analyze the conditions for operationalizing loans and financing to guarantee this new project's adequacy in relation to the characteristics of community-based projects, and specifically those carried out by Pracatum, such as : (a) extended deadlines to design the project – the result of effective adoption of participatory practices for its conclusion; (b) the need

⁷ This consisted of the requirement that funds from that program be applied to guarantee an adequate infrastructure before subsequently renovating or replacing the housing.

⁸ The amount was converted from Brazilian reals to US dollars according to the exchange rate of Jun 2003: US \$ 1,00 = R\$ 3,00.

⁹ Idem.

¹⁰ Idem.

to review targets, deadlines, and funds according to the peculiarities identified in the field and (c) the virtually "handcrafted" nature of the actions based on the team's creativity and the aesthetic concept rooted in the community as the result of its consolidated cultural identity. Besides, these same characteristics have been highlighted by CAIXA as a highly relevant factor for assimilating new intervention methods and approaches by the specific team at that institution.

The role of neighborhood associations

Pracatum went to great length to implement practices that would guarantee community participation in defining action lines in the "Tá Rebocado" Project. In this sense a key task for the team was to approach the Project's proposals with the neighborhood associations that have existed for decades in Candeal: the "Nove de Outubro" Neighborhood Association, the "Defesa e Progresso" Neighborhood Association, and the "Fonte do Governo" Neighborhood Association, thereby helping lay the groundwork to guarantee their participation in designing these actions, involving all the way from choice of priorities to the implementation and evaluation of results.

The neighborhood associations were also key stakeholders to the collection of local census data, publicizing the information and convening community meetings. The fact that they had their roots in the community before Pracatum foundation contributed greatly to the community's receptiveness to the Project and to minimize occasional conflicts arising from the spatial distribution of the resulting benefits (since the Project was implemented gradually, and based on socioeconomic surveys, the choice was made to prioritize certain areas in the beginning).

These neighborhood associations played an especially outstanding role in sustaining and legitimizing the actions carried out in the Practice when the community assemblies were interrupted. Based on the field interviews, in addition to the frequent and informal contact between the Project team and Candeal residents, participation by the neighborhood associations in the decision-making process helped maintain the links established with the general population.

For a more detailed analysis of the process and the inherent characteristics of these associations before and after the Project implementation, see the section on Community Organization and Empowerment.

Other partnerships

New, specific partnerships were added to the institutional architecture set up originally to implement the Project, resulting either from explicit demands by the community at large (when the community assemblies were still being held) or from the evaluation of factors concerning feasibility and timeliness by the management team, aimed among other things at diversifying sources of institutional funding in light of the risks involved in unidirectional fundraising for developing the activities.

In 1999, during the implementation of the Project's first stage, several vocational training courses were held (on safety, street vending, "*quituteiras*" or vendors of traditional Bahian food, musicians, and junior musicians), with resources from the Fund for Workers' Assistance (FAT) and in partnership with the Ministry of Labor and Employment and the Board of Directors of the Fund for Workers' Assistance (CODEFAT).¹¹

In 2000 and 2001, the Association to Support Training with Solidarity was in charge of providing courses on "Dental Office Attendants" and "Massage Therapy" to expand the line of action on Employment and Income Generation in the community. The courses were obtained by submitting a proposal in a nationwide contest, and the latter was also supported through a specific agreement between Pracatum and UNIPAZ. As the justification for these types of courses being offered in Candéal, Pracatum reports that in the vicinity there are job openings capable of absorbing this skilled labor.

The Committee for the Democratization of Information Technology (CDI) has joined in the actions developed in Candéal by training computer instructors selected from the community itself in order to subsequently set up basic and advanced computer courses at the headquarters of the existing neighborhood associations. These courses are under way in the Nove de Outubro Neighborhood Association, with technical support from CDI. Low-income residents of the Candéal community and other neighborhoods of Salvador are enrolled in this Association and pay a monthly tuition fee of US \$ 3,00 (three dollars).

Negotiations are currently under way to set up an English course in the headquarters of the Defesa e Progresso Neighborhood Association, with a similar format to the computer course, as a result of the partnership recently signed between Pracatum and UEC.

SEBRAE

Participation by SEBRAE in the "Tá Rebocado" Project resulted from a request by Pracatum, initially done by Carlinhos Brown, to develop activities related to employment and income generation in the community. In 2000, due to the lack of funds specifically earmarked for work in Candéal and thus the need to use the institution's regular budget funds, SEBRAE took charge of only a few specific activities, such as training leaders, street vendors, and local entrepreneurs.

As the result of a joint assessment indicating the need for and importance of ongoing action by this institution, the SEBRAE office in Salvador requested US\$ 16,600.00 (sixteen thousand and six hundred dollars) in funds from the SEBRAE national office to develop activities related to the implementation of a Local Development Plan (LDP) and an Economic Development Plan (EDP). This request was

¹¹ It was not possible to determine the amount of funds used in these training courses, and thus this amount was not included in the item on funds raised in the Project Identification Form (see Appendix).

made specifically by Pracatum to determine the profile of local Candeal small businesses and to develop strategies to upgrade their activities or redirect their investments in the area.

To achieve these goals, a participatory diagnosis and Business Census were conducted through the channels already established by Pracatum, the immediate result of which was the formation of a management group consisting of local leaders and businesses, in agreement with the SEBRAE methodology. The LDP and EDP are in the final stages of elaboration for subsequent presentation to the community and the inclusion of new proposals and suggestions.

To begin analyzing the negotiation process between Pracatum and SEBRAE, we consider the fact that each institution has its own social technology for fostering development in a given community. In this sense, and according to the field interviews, a constant dialogue was necessary between the two institutions in order to agree on strategies to avoid the juxtaposition of practices, activities, and outputs and to optimize and guarantee the functionality of the actions. This result is not always easy to achieve, particularly in the short run, due to the recurrent trend towards deeply rooted institutional methods and specific procedures for achieving a given target or action.

In the case at hand, these potential complicating factors were probably related to the similarity in the actions carried out by the two institutions, since analogous difficulties were described in previous sub-chapters, although in a sense the two partners lacked a common space for debate and discussion.

The results of work by SEBRAE in Candeal thus included the formulation of the Nucleus for Institutional Articulation (NAI), aimed at integrating the various collaborators in the same Practice, the formation of which is planned to coincide with the launching of the LDP in early 2003. Still, to maintain the partnership between SEBRAE and Pracatum this year it will be necessary to resubmit a formatted intervention proposal to the national office of SEBRAE. Negotiations on this resubmission have not begun yet, even within Pracatum.

Lessons learned

Analysis of the Project's implementation in light of its characteristics and targets help highlight some useful lessons for initiatives aimed at transferring the experience. The following remarks are based on observations to date.

Contributions to transferability of the Practice

Planning the intervention and carrying out the activities

- In order to ensure the effectiveness and impact of planned actions, a survey with precise information on the area is absolutely necessary.

- Participation by local community leaders in the definition, follow-up, and evaluation of a Project is an extremely important factor for guaranteeing community mobilization in a legitimate and representative community development program. Creating spaces for this purpose should be a specific target for the success of community projects.
- In projects intended to meet specific and gradual demands, such as housing and infrastructure, it is important to be aware that after some demands have been met, it is highly likely that the level of community participation will decrease. The consolidation of spaces to foster the effective appropriation of the Project by the community can help minimize this tendency. In the specific case of Pracatum, the multiple roles ascribed to the Assembly and its subsequent transformation into a space for claims and expressing specific demands may have been an additional difficulty in the task of empowering and consolidating the community intervention in the Pracatum institutional mission and thus in the targets and objectives of the "Tá Rebocado" Project in general.

Partnerships and fundraising

- Flexibility in relation to the Project's design and utilization of resources has been a key factor, along with the creativity of the team and the partners in their willingness to take daring measures.
- When attempting to transfer the Practice, it is important to remember that the fundraising capacity in a new project will rarely be linked to a leader as famous as Carlinhos Brown; that is, expectations raised in the community should not become a source of demobilization.
- The time needed to release the funds and the moment of hiring the team to carry out the project should also coincide, in order not to have to utilize an organization's own regular budget resources in order to continue the Project, given that this possible alternative rarely repeats itself in similar situations in other areas and based on the intervention of other leaders.
- The existence of a formal space for dialogue between the different institutional and financial partners in a single experience helps optimize the resources and enhance the potential of the initiatives. Despite the success achieved by the Practice, CAIXA, CONDER, and Pracatum all refer to the need for formal joint meetings in the subsequent stages of the Project.

3

The Project according to strategic analytical variables

3.1 Partnerships - the role and performance of partner institutions

As explained in the previous chapter, there is no apparent homogeneity in the roles played by the partner institutions in the development of the "Tá Rebocado" Project. The agencies in charge of financing the initiative (CAIXA and Government of the State of Bahia) were definitely the ones that guaranteed the most support for the experience. Adding to the initial Action Plan there were other institutions that were merely in charge of specific actions, generally related to training and employment and income generation in the Candéal community.

The latter partnerships, which were established exclusively to provide training and technical support for the Project, were generally not interconnected to the other partnerships. As a result, they grasped little from the actions carried out or financed by the previously mentioned institutions, the lessons in the difficulties involved in establishing a collective Project of such dimensions, or the evaluation of its results.

However, analyzing the task of building a partnership that involves not only funding activities or supplying a specific service suggests that a difficulty is necessarily imposed on the process. Numerous factors must be taken into consideration (many of which are not in the sphere of governance of the agencies that promote and implement the action), in order to be able to consistently evaluate the success of the enterprise or the partnerships. The partner institution's interest in actually participating in the Project and the mission ascribed to the institution to measure and evaluate the degree of interest and the efforts undertaken to achieve the respective results are examples of important variables for producing such an evaluation. In this sense (and despite the observed lack of a channel to guarantee the integration of various institutional interventions), one can infer, based on the nature of the stakeholders in the process, that they would not be expected to be equally involved in the Project's design and development. However, such a situation does not necessarily jeopardize the experience, as long as the Project's promoting or implementing agencies assume a central role guaranteeing the non-juxtaposition of actions and the definition of instruments that express both specific responsibilities and the need to flexibilize the separately presented proposals and actions.

Based on the field interviews, it indeed appears that the adequate exercise of this central role, which is sometimes considered simple to assume, requires sufficient time, organization, infrastructure, and human resources. To carry out multi-sectoral, participatory projects that are intended to promote different economic and social rights in communities which, because of their living conditions, require urgent action and attention, it is necessary to guarantee an adequate institutional infrastructure, even if initially it is not acknowledged as a priority or action in which to invest technically.

3.2 Impacts – analysis and evaluation of results and impacts

Any evaluation of the results and impacts of the "Tá Rebocado" Project begins with a combined analysis of the achievement of the previously planned objectives, results, and targets, with the initial document as the reference (drafted together with the community in 1996).

To facilitate the analysis, we will describe the results based on the five planned lines of action, as outlined in the item Components and Actions (except for Community Organization, which will be covered in a specific sub-chapter).

Housing/infrastructure and urban renewal

Consisting of what are considered priority demands by the Candeal population, this line of action was the object of great attention by the "Tá Rebocado" team. Nearly all of the scheduled actions were actually carried out, producing a visible impact on the overall community's living conditions and way of life. Improvements in existing housing units, construction of new units to replace what were considered hazardous dwellings, the recovery and expansion of the street system, the installation of a sewage system, and the expansion of the storm sewer system, water supply, and public lighting were the interventions whose results are referred to most frequently by the local population. This is why community members often associate the Project exclusively with these actions, as demonstrated in the field interviews.

However, among the scheduled actions the following were not carried out in the construction of community facilities: community fountains; a community garden in Fonte do Governo; and the Candeal Cultural Center and Health Post. The Health Post was actually built over a year ago, but problems with the equipment involving requirements by the public health inspection department (for which sufficient resources had not been planned) have prevented it from operating. The limited flexibility mentioned previously in relation to the release of funds or complementary contractual clauses has hindered a solution to this problem and produced an extremely negative impact on the community, since the demand for this action was identified as a priority when the initial intervention was planned.

Pracatum, CAIXA, and CONDER, based on negotiations, foresee that the requirements will be met in the third stage, now under way.

In relation to the other community equipment and facilities, although they were included in the action plan drafted with the community, they were not included in the initial budget earmarked by CAIXA, due to the adjustments that became necessary. This serves to demonstrate their priority among the community's expectations, and they thus do not serve to decrease the Project's popularity or to ascribe negative points to the Project's development. The construction of a Cultural and Trade Center in Candéal is the only proposal in this line of action that is still pending, and it is necessary to raise funds for it. The proposal to build community fountains, originally intended to help preserve the traditional local life (where people were accustomed to washing laundry in the open air) was discarded by the population itself after the housing improvements were made. The Project's technical staff now feels that the proposal for a community garden (which would serve primarily for planting medicinal herbs) was raised by the staff rather than the community itself.

Infrastructure works scheduled in the Project also included renovations in the headquarters of the Nove de Outubro and Defesa do Progresso Neighborhood Associations (the latter currently under way) and served as a key factor in the expanded use of these facilities by the local population. The renovation allowed for several courses in the headquarters, thus fostering a greater grasp of the Project's actions. Still pending is construction of a headquarters for the Fonte do Governo Neighborhood Association (AMFOGO), which currently holds its meetings in neighborhood bars or in people's homes. Construction of this headquarters is scheduled for the Project's third stage, but according to the field interviews the delay in the construction work has led to some discredit on the part of the local community and reduced their level of participation. Likewise, residents of Fonte do Governo resent the fact that their area was not a priority for the housing improvements, since only 13 units were renovated.

For a better understanding of the scope of the benefits introduced by this line of action, note that Candéal is divided informally by the community itself into various areas, with their respective neighborhood associations: Nove de Outubro (Nove de Outubro Association); Sapucaia (Defesa e Progresso Association); Carmelo (without a formal association, but represented by a strong local leadership); and Fonte do Governo (with the association of the same name). The Carmelo and Fonte areas, both located on higher ground in Candéal, although contemplated in the Project, have received interventions on a smaller scale. This choice was justified by the team based on the urgent need for intervention in the swampy lowland area known traditionally as Ilha do Sapó (literally "Toad's Island"), located in the lower part of Candéal¹² and subject to constant flooding due to the haphazard sewage and storm drainage conditions and the lower-quality housing, since the area was characterized by squatting.

¹² Since Ilha do Sapó was where musician Carlinhos Brown's own home was located, it was rather difficult for residents from Fonte and Carmelo to understand the priority intervention there on strictly technical rather than personal grounds.

In addition, the housing improvements in the Project's second stage did not receive a highly positive evaluation by either the local leaders or the Project's team, based on their quality and the fact that they failed to meet the expectations of the beneficiary population. Local leaders and the Project team believe that the background of the contractors, the limited amount of funds involved, and the lack of technical training for the local residents themselves in identifying the need for reorienting the construction work before it was concluded were factors in these less-than-satisfactory results. During the third stage of the Project, local leaders and the Pracatum team are studying several alternative strategies to overcome these difficulties. Some of the possible alternatives include establishing a services cooperative to replace the conventionally hired contractors, as well as training a group of local residents to directly monitor the construction work and collaborate in the inspection by CAIXA and CONDER.

Education and culture

Implementation of the Music Training School was the first cultural enhancement activity in the community. Linking the functioning of the School to the actions by the "Tá Rebocado" Project was thus a challenge for the team, in the sense of the institution's two inter-dependent projects being linked in the local community's imagination.

Based on previous observations, implementation of the Music School was apparently distant from the proposals of the "Tá Rebocado" Project, although both produced positive impacts of their own.

As for the School specifically, it is important to mention that enrollment was opened up to residents from other communities in Salvador by means of a selection process, amongst other reasons to charge a monthly tuition fee to help guarantee the School's financial sustainability. Due to both this decision, the difficulty experienced by students from Candeal in keeping up with the courses in the two years devoted to professional specialization in music (a course series following the two basic years of music initiation), and the choice by the Candeal students not to professionalize, most of the students are now from neighborhoods other than Candeal. This process has been the object of some concern on the part of the executive directors and the School's principal, who intend to keep enrollment open to students from the city of Salvador as a whole, while encouraging priority for students from Candeal.

The initial expectation at the Music School that priority would be given to hiring teachers from the neighborhood itself in order to tap the local artistic potential resulted in only one local teacher remaining at the School, in light of the "classical" or "erudite" approach to the teaching curriculum and the need to hire more specialized teaching staff.

Based on the combination of these factors, plus the fact that the School was not an absolute priority in the community (despite the latter's undeniable artistic potential), led community members to dissociate the two projects and (according to the interviews) to associate the School with other private projects owned and directed by Carlinhos Brown.

However, despite these observations, the community appears to take pride in the School, referring to it as a major factor for local cultural dissemination and for demystifying the area as a slum written off from the city's agenda. This impact is highly important for raising the community's self-esteem and for feeding back into Candéal the positive impacts that the School produces on Salvador residents in general.

The other actions scheduled in the "Tá Rebocado" Action Plan (construction of the Children's Center; construction of centers for semi-industrial production focused on the cultural and entertainment industry, recording, printing, and manufacturing of props; construction of points of sale and distribution for the production from these previous centers; adult literacy training; and dissemination of environmental education¹³) were largely not materialized due to the difficulty in obtaining resources (like some of the actions related to infrastructure, some of the above-mentioned activities were not included in the items to be financed by CAIXA and the State Government/CONDER). Of these actions, only the adult literacy course was actually carried out in the community, in addition to a project called Art-Education, focused on training local residents in the dissemination of local culture.

The adult literacy course is extremely important for local Candéal residents, to the point of enrolling students from other low-income communities in Salvador. There are currently 12 adults enrolled, ten women and two men, ranging in age from 21 to 72 years. Until December 2002 there were 21 students in the class, and the dropouts occurred due to a three-month interruption in the classroom activities because of a delay in the release of funds. At any rate, the course's impact can be measured by the student's testimony (for example, the changes in their lives from being able to identify bus lines, letters and bills received, understanding physician's prescriptions, etc.) and for their subsequent success in obtaining grade equivalent diplomas in the regular school system and the increase in the number of students applying to take the GED (General Educational Development) tests. In 2001, 2 out of 4 students (50%) who took GED tests for primary school passed the test; in 2002, of the 8 students who took the test, 4 passed (again, 50%).

Employment and income generation

The initial goal of the Employment and Income Generation line of action was to provide vocational training for local residents through technical cooperative contracts with the State Government/CONDER and partnerships with other institutions that joined the Project in response to its fundraising policy.

¹³ This activity will be described in the item on Health and the Environment.

Among the courses outlined above, the computer course was a highlight and resulted in employment for several young people from the Candeal community, who were trained as computer teachers through the services provided by the Committee for the Democratization of Information Technology (CDI). The other courses did not lead to a similar channeling into the labor market (and this was not the Project's explicit goal when they were first implemented). However, the "Tá Rebocado" team has been studying the possibility of setting up a service similar to the National Employment System (SINE) as a clearinghouse for local labor.

Note also that most of the courses were offered as the result of an analysis and utilization of opportunities by the Project's technical staff, and there was thus no direct relationship with the community's demands, even though the courses were in keeping with the local population's profile and the job supply in the surrounding area. The team itself views the results of these courses as insufficient, based on indicators such as dropout rates or even idle enrollment capacity.

Analyzing these data and those from field contacts, one can thus state that the measures actually responsible for increasing income in the community were linked to: 1) an undertaking not specifically related to the "Tá Rebocado" activities, although its effects were led by the latter through the training courses for street vendors and 2) the impact of other actions carried out by the Project, especially those involving housing improvements and provision of infrastructure.

1) The Candyall Guetho Square Entertainment Center, the stage for rehearsals and concerts by "*Grupo Timbalada*", attracts approximately 3,000 middle and upper class youth from all over Salvador on Sundays in the summer. Although local Candeal residents do not normally attend the festivities because of the cost of admission on average US\$15 a head, they report that they benefit from the events because of the abundance of informal commercial activities around the Center, such as the sale of beverages, "*acarajés*" (traditional Afro-Brazilian bean cakes, very popular local delicacy), other snacks, etc. In addition to the courses offered to develop such activities, Pracatum has managed a registry of vendors, mapped out their points of sale, and produced clothing to identify Candeal residents in order to ensure that outside vendors do not take over the local territory. This initiative, which has depended heavily on participation by municipal law enforcement agencies, has helped inhibit but has not totally prevented the outside competition from occupying the Candeal area.

2) Likewise, other Project activities, as discussed previously, were important factors to generate the employment and income to community members, although one cannot identify a strict cause-and-effect relationship between the facts based on the research methods used. According to information gathered by SEBRAE to prepare the previously mentioned Business Census, there was virtually a fourfold increase in the number of businesses in the neighborhood from April 1997 to November 2001 (regardless of whether they are formally incorporated or not), emphasizing the fact that 25% of these new business establishments have existed for less than one year. Although the data are insufficient for measuring the revenue

levels of these new enterprises, one can at least conclude that local residents received a strong stimulus to invest in the area during the period in which the Project was developed and the first results appeared.

Health and the environment

The actions in this Project component aim to improve the population's health conditions, raise awareness concerning the benefits of preserving the environment, and thus optimize the infrastructure and urban renewal work.

To begin the activities in this line of action, a group was formed called "Candeal Presente" to deal with alcohol abuse, a widespread problem in the community. The role of this group, which consisted initially of 12 local residents, was expanded over the course of the Project, resulting in support for the following interventions: a mobile dental service in 2002 in partnership with the Bahia Association of Social Volunteers; implementation in 1999 of the Oral Hygiene Program (in partnership with CONDER, the Federal University in Bahia, and the Brazilian Association of Dentistry); the 1st Health Fair (in December 1999), providing orientation on reproductive health, sexually transmissible diseases, and healthy eating habits, in addition to measuring blood pressure in adults and weighing children from birth to 10 years.

When this group was originally organized, the members had the support of a physician, a psychologist, and a teacher. According to local residents, these professionals contributed greatly to the success and impact of these activities. At present there are no such professionals working in the "Tá Rebocado" team, which according to the interviews has hampered the work by the group and demobilized the community in relation to the health issue. There is no activities plan and the general belief is that specific training is lacking to move forward even with some focused health-related activities.

In addition, the fact that the Health Center is not functioning is referred to as a demobilizing factor for the group. A public admissions examination was held in the city of Salvador for hiring health attendants and community-based health agents, but only two people from Candeal passed the exam. Nearly four years of participation in health-related activities in the community had raised expectations among members of the "Candeal Presente" group and the Pracatum team itself concerning insertion in the work market, and the hope was to be able to flexibilize the effects of a situation that was out of reach of their possibilities for action.

Currently, a major portion of the members of the above-mentioned group belong to the so-called Management Group, mobilized through SEBRAE's participation in the area.

3.3 Sustainability

Initially, and despite the different analytical dimensions listed below, since "Tá Rebocado" is a community-based development project, the indicators for its possible maintenance and empowerment derive mainly from an evaluation of the processes aimed at guaranteeing community self-management. In this sense, a portrait of the benefits produced by the Project on the Candeal environment, or a description of its capacity to enhance the value of local culture, for example, should be closely linked to an analysis of its mechanisms to guarantee a protagonist role by residents and their recognition of the need to acquire specific skills allowing them to manage and define the nature of future actions after conclusion of the intervention project managed by Pracatum.

The following comments are thus intended not only as an observation of certain specificities, potentialities, and difficulties in the Project, but will also be considered during discussion of the item on Community Organization and Empowerment.

Environmental sustainability

The Project's contributions to environmental sustainability are expressed by the impact produced on the quality of the environment in Candeal, based on the expansion of the water supply system, the recovery of the Bica spring, orientation on proper disposal of waste and sewage, slope stabilization, replacement of housing units located in hazardous areas, and especially the relationship established for self-management of the community development process in general.

However, some of the finished construction is currently undergoing deterioration, especially in the housing projects built to relocate families previously living in hazardous areas or other areas expropriated for public use. The change in the building patterns in the houses (despite having been defined jointly with the target public) and the limited care devoted to up-keep on private housing units and common-use areas are examples of the situation observed in the area and reported during interviews in the field research.

According to the interviews, there have also been two isolated initiatives to re-sell the renovated housing units through purchase-and-sale contracts or informal agreements to transfer possession of the property after the land tenure regularization by the State Government, following the construction work in the third stage of the Project.

In order to limit the impacts of the above-mentioned problems, the "Tá Rebocado" team, aware of the probable difficulty on the part of local residents in adapting to new forms of community living and sharing common areas, has been

developing a specific project involving training and awareness-raising workshops in the housing projects and the election of building supervisors in charge of monitoring and inspecting the area and ensuring an ongoing dialogue with the other residents. Due to the reduction in the activities of the "Candeal Presente" group, which had been working with environmental education activities since it was first organized, a project has been developed with the support of the Youth Group organized in August 2001 to represent the community and promote and publicize events.

Cultural sustainability

Considering that the cultural sustainability provided by a project should aim at the development and preservation of local community values, knowledge, and potential, the "Tá Rebocado" Project, based on its characteristics and objectives, has assumed this variable as a basic premise for its action. Both the Project's inherent proposals and the model it chose to pursue them are characterized by the maintenance of the community ethos and stimulus for empowering local customs and culture. The Project team's recognition and grasp of the community's self-ascribed identity is expressed in the design of the educational projects and employment and income generation activities, as well as the aesthetic details in the construction or renovation of housing units. Colors and graphic designs are mixed with other details that shape Candeal's racial and musical identity.

In this sense, the Music Training School plays a key role in raising community self-esteem and drawing out the symbolism that maintains it; thus the importance of a Practice that adopts strategies to foster a close approach with the local population.

Financial and economic sustainability

To guarantee a project's financial and economic sustainability, it is generally agreed that it is necessary to generate some type of revenue to maintain it, independently of new external funding. In the specific case of the "Tá Rebocado" Project, the analysis of its financial sustainability can be confused with that of institutional sustainability, and it is thus indispensable to separate the Pracetum sustainability policy, the current prospects for finalizing the specific Practice, and the strategies introduced adopted in the community to ensure the continuity of the actions implemented to date.

The following indicators can be used for this purpose:

- The relationship between the investments generated and those demanded by the Project and;
- The expansion of the maintenance capacity of individuals themselves and the management of collective activities by local residents and leaders.

Despite the situation referred to previously with the release of funds and the supplementary funds that were required to implement the Project, current negotiations with the State Government demonstrate the adequacy of the proposals and the actual achievement of the targets and results in the different operational dimensions.

As for the increased possibility of maintenance of acquired benefits and goods by the residents themselves, in relation to comments concerning the treatment of impacts produced by the actions focused on employment and income generation in the community, the interviews identify an installed capacity for payment of the taxes and tariffs related to new services as well as monthly installments on the housing units (to be paid to CAIXA), which are factors that reconfirm the adequacy of the proposals and negotiations in relation to the local population's socioeconomic profile and demands.

In addition, the "Tá Rebocado" Project intended to act not only on individual sustainability of these benefits, through attempts to raise the local residents' incomes, but also on the collective capacity to develop new projects, establish new partnerships, and manage actions related to the provision of new services to potentially be introduced by the public sector and by other civil society organizations. Training of local leaders, the constant interface with the neighborhood associations, and the transfer of responsibility to these associations for managing some of the new services (such as computer courses) are outstanding examples of the importance of consolidating the Candéal development process. Negotiations with the institution's partners already include the neighborhood associations as managing bodies for various actions. The English course scheduled in partnership with UEC in the Defesa e Progresso Neighborhood Association is an example of this effort.

3.4 Community leadership and empowerment

As mentioned previously, Candéal already had an intense level of community organization before Pracatum was founded and began acting. The very existence of residents' associations in the neighborhood demonstrated how the community chose to organize its social relations, launching initiatives to improve the quality of life of the local population. Such as: (a) collective cleaning efforts in public areas, (b) collective construction work in the headquarters of the neighborhood associations and housing units in the squatting areas, (c) collective construction of stairways providing access to the community, as well as formal submission of demands to government officials and agencies in Salvador for installing various public utilities like water and electricity, thus representing the action potential already developed in Candéal.

However, due to the fact that residents are represented according to different physical and geographic sub-areas defined according to different housing

areas and ease of recognition, according to the information from interviews, the neighborhood associations ended up becoming differentiated "niches" of activity, and spaces and mechanisms were not always developed that could ensure the integration of their actions and proposals or even sharing their expectations and demands.

In this sense, the scenario found by Pracatum, and especially by the "Tá Rebocado" Project team, although extremely rich from the point of view of commitment by local leaders to the implementation of a sustainable development process, was characterized by the following constraints: (a) dispersion of objectives and efforts; (b) apparent difficulty in establishing legitimate channels for representation of common, non-sectoral interests; and (c) the need to create instruments or practices to help minimize conflicts resulting from the collective exercise of the choice of priorities that benefited some of the sub-areas to the detriment of others.

To overcome this situation of dispersion, the community assemblies made an important contribution (especially considering their pedagogical nature), namely the systematic meetings between the three associations and other local leaders, and the organization of focus groups when the above-mentioned assemblies were interrupted (the Youth Group and the Management Group). The results of these initiatives are expressed by the alliances formed between the associations, including the joint management of certain programs and their participation in setting Project criteria that were not specifically related to benefiting the areas they represented.

INTERVIEW

"We believe that such profound social capital was organized precisely because the community learning stage was respected. The community already understands when it is necessary to remove a house from a given lot because the area is needed to build a health post, etc. (...) that it is necessary to benefit a given area because the health conditions are worse there (...) People are learning to live with a democratic process."

However, it is important to mention that despite having overcome the distance between the various spheres of community representation, Pracatum fears having taken on too large a role in the local development process or having established such a central sphere that it may hinder the maintenance of ties established during the Project's implementation phase. Although the leaders themselves recognize the organizational and political maturity acquired through the Practice, there is no consensus among them concerning the existing capacity for the maintenance of actions and relations based on intervention after finalization of the stages in the "Tá Rebocado" Project. Several community leaders are currently concerned about the degree of dependency involved in managing Pracatum, and measures to provide greater security for existing institutions and leaders should be encouraged.

In addition, Candeal displays several characteristics that are common to other communities (whether low-income or not): difficulty in renewing leadership and expanding effective participation by residents in general in the decision-making process and institutional activities.

Although enjoying legitimacy and recognition among local residents, the existing neighborhood associations experience such difficulties in establishing boards of directors who, after being elected, encounter impasses in maintaining their grassroots links. Even now, after a major portion of the renovation work has been done on their headquarters, which certainly helped promote the community meetings and increased the communications capacity of the neighborhood associations, there still appears to be a culture of passive (rather than active) participation in the Candeal community.

The task of changing this scenario is more of a priority for the community itself than for Pracatum. However, an analysis of some results of the Practice merit attention due to their impact on the community receptiveness towards the various actions and the capacity to develop these actions themselves. Since the same individuals or leaders always tend to be the ones who carry out the various activities, the new focus groups, for example, run the risk of losing their reason for being or the risk of becoming too weak to keep their activities going. The demobilization of the "Candeal Presente" group, whose role was considered significant by local leaders and residents, confirms this observation, since its members joined the Management Group, redirecting the focus of their work.

While such issues cannot be solved exclusively by specific projects with given time frames, attention to similar contexts can enhance the development of given actions and help target and implement what are considered priority or structural actions.

3.5 Gender and social inclusion

The most frequently identified impacts of the programs and policies implemented within the sphere of the "Tá Rebocado" Project relate to the community's increased self-esteem and ownership. A feeling of "belonging" to an area in which one can take pride because of the gains obtained, the dissemination of local artistic and cultural potential, and the change in the city's view towards the neighborhood and its residents. The Candeal favela or slum has thus been transformed, especially in people's imagination, becoming a tourist spot capable of attracting residents of other neighborhoods, artists and entertainers, and politicians and government officials. As such, the Project offer opportunities for increasing the community's capacity to express itself and especially for increasing the local residents' income level (note that thus far it has been impossible to measure the actual reduction in

unemployment in the area, which was 17% when the local census was performed by the Pracatum team in 1997).

The same census portrayed Candeal as a highly diversified community from the point of view of schooling, yet indicating the need to invest in complementary formal education and vocational training courses to foster insertion of local residents in the urban labor market. The courses provided by Pracatum together with various partners, the adult literacy course, and the Music Training School are actions frequently referred to as bolstering this effort.

In relation to the Project's contribution to valuing differences in the social inclusion process, the "Tá Rebocado" Project is investing in practices that ensure women's security and autonomy. Currently under consideration is the possibility of including "female heads of households" as the decisive criterion (all other factors being equal) in selecting housing units for improvements or in construction of housing units in the third stage of the Project. In addition, according to information gathered through the interviews, there is a tendency to register the new housing units in the woman's name.

Furthermore, the Candeal community, whose population profile points to a basic gender balance (48% males and 52% women), is characterized by intense political participation by women (especially as compared to participation by their male counterparts), which is claimed to not merely be the result of the fact that women tend to spend more time inside the community.

Interview

"Around here it's the women who really participate...We only get involved when they think it's necessary. We even participate in the meetings, but the women are the ones who make the decisions."

From this angle, the "Tá Rebocado" Project has greatly empowered the political and organizational maturity of this specific group, yet without jeopardizing attempts to get the male public more involved in the Project's decision-making spheres.

The quantitative and qualitative information obtained on the Practice point initially to a work dynamic that correctly prioritizes the Project's development process (including an adequate and sufficient survey of the population's living conditions, a participatory diagnosis of the community's expectations and demands, and the joint elaboration of intervention plans and stages), unlike other initiatives characterized by the juxtaposition of the need to achieve results and the creation of spaces and instruments capable of contributing to gradual and successful achievement.

This choice was certainly not without complications, but these were compensated for by the learning process among the technical teams and residents, especially in projects aimed at empowering community organization and self-management. For example, difficulties in establishing and maintaining partnerships (e.g., when the time needed to secure and release funding can be different from the time it takes the community organization process to reach fruition) deserve to be anticipated in order for strategies to overcome such impasses to help lead the work. The temporary interruption of some activities in the "Tá Rebocado" Project call attention to this, as well as the previously mentioned need to establish formal channels for dialogue to facilitate the partners' understanding of the Practice's pace, allowing for joint reflection on the viable alternatives, meanwhile meeting the deadlines and budget requirements which are sometimes beyond the control or wishes of the various parties.

In addition, the transferability of this experience requires specific attention to several factors related to Candeal:

- **The existence of an office or headquarters for the organization implementing or managing the actions inside the intervention area.**

This is highly important, especially because the project includes urbanization and infrastructure interventions, fostering a close dialogue with the community and ongoing, direct evaluation of the actions as they unfold. Considering the context of nongovernmental organizations in Brazil, the probability of establishing institutional headquarters in areas targeted for intervention is quite limited, and it may be necessary to consider alternatives to approach the target public (beyond contact with the leaders that may exist in the community). Meanwhile, when such a headquarters exists, attention should be given to differentiating between spaces or moments devoted to the community's intervention in a specific project and its

participation in the institutional management (Governing Council, General Assembly, etc.) in order to avoid weakening or undermining both such initiatives.

- **The existence and capacity for expression.**

The transferability of the experience is not necessarily reduced if it is implemented in a community with less political participation and organization, although the scenario found by Pracatum definitely contributed to the success of the Practice. The creation of channels allowing for the community to grasp the Project and define effective strategies for mobilizing and publicizing the Practice will prove absolutely crucial to its development and the achievement of the proposed objectives. The juxtaposition of representation by residents and leaders in different channels or groups of activity should be the object of attention by the team submitting the proposal in order to optimize the activities, reduce the possibilities of demobilizing the population, and avoid wasting public or private resources. The experience of the Pracatum managers also shows the need to focus on the links established between the institution proposing the project and those already existing in the community in order to avoid producing the de-politicization of local groups or stakeholders as an unintended effect of the Practice.

- **The existence of an internationally renowned leader whose social work is recognized by government authorities and public and private funding agencies.**

The association between the image of leader-musician Carlinhos Brown and the Candeal community constituted a fundamental factor for the successful development of the fundraising policy. In addition, the fact that he invested financially in Candeal helped minimize difficulties on several occasions when the schedules failed to coincide between the Project maturation and the deadlines established by the funding partners. As mentioned previously, attention to such aspects can contribute to the appropriate assessment of residents' expectations and even those of promoting agencies in communities with different characteristics.

Finally, lessons left by Pracatum and worthy of transferability in similar experiences involve detailed observation of the difficulties inherent to implementing the proposed intervention and of strategies for overcoming the impasses as they arise (even if the process is not formally and systematically evaluated).

In light of these remarks, the lines of action proposed and employed by the "Tá Rebocado" Project illustrate the sensitivity and success of the Practice. Planning a multi-sectoral Practice in communities – that have been marginalized from the use of public services and even from exercising their basic citizenship – provides huge potential for changing situations of historical social exclusion, especially when the thrust of such a Practice is to value local culture and the production of knowledge by the community itself – a thrust that has been adopted by "Tá Rebocado", Pracatum, and their partner institutions since the process began.

To express the community's recognition of the gains achieved through the Project, nothing better than the words of a local resident, confirmed by the Project team and reported enthusiastically by the main partners in the Project – CAIXA and CONDER: "*The main 'problem' we face today in Candéal is the immense pride that the people feel.*"

Bibliography

BARATTA, Tereza Cristina B. (Coord.). *Termo de referência para a elaboração de estudos de caso; Caixa Best Practice Program in Local Management*. Rio de Janeiro: IBAM/CAIXA, 2000.

CARACTERIZAÇÃO da atividade econômica empresarial do Bairro do Candeal; análise dos principais aspectos e sugestões para sua dinamização. [S.I.]: SEBRAE, 2001.

FORMULÁRIO de apresentação das melhores práticas – Tá Rebocado. Brasília. [Submission Format]: CAIXA, 2001.

JOHNSNOWBRASIL CONSULTORIA. *Planejamento estratégico institucional*. [S.I.], 2002.

PENNA FIRME, Denise; SANTOS, Alexandre; BARATTA, Tereza Cristina . *Estudo de caso do projeto vila-bairro: Teresina-Piauí*. Rio de Janeiro: IBAM/ENSUR, [2001].

PRACATUM. *Apresentação Institucional – Associação Pracatum Ação Social – Programas: Tá Rebocado e Escola Profissionalizante de Música e Tecnologia*. Salvador, [199?].

_____. *Programa de desenvolvimento comunitário-Tá Rebocado*. Planejamento 2001. Salvador, 2001.

_____. *Relatório mensal de atividades*. Salvador, jun. 2000.

_____. *Relatório mensal de atividades*. Salvador, jul. 2000.

_____. *Relatório mensal de atividades*. Salvador, ago./set. 2000.

_____. *Relatório mensal de atividades*. Salvador, out./dez. 2000.

_____. *Relatório de atividades*. Salvador, jan./fev. 2001.

_____. *Relatório de atividades*. Salvador, mar./abr. 2001.

_____. *Relatório de atividades*. Salvador, maio/jun. 2001.

_____. *Relatório de atividades*. Salvador, jul./ago. 2001.

_____. *Relatório de atividades*. Salvador, jan./fev. 2002.

_____. *Relatório de atividades*. Salvador, set./dez. 2002.

PROGRAMA de desenvolvimento local – Bairro do Candeal – diagnóstico participativo.
[S.I.]: SEBRAE, 2002.

TRANCOSO, Maria Angélica de Medeiros; TEIXEIRA, Heloísa Geraldo de Moraes. *Tá Rebocado – habitação para a população de baixa renda, Salvador/BA.* Rio de Janeiro: IBAM/CAIXA, 2002. (Guidelines Manual for Replication of Local Management Best Practices – 2001/2002).



APPENDICES

APPENDIX I Abbreviations

Abbreviations	
ABO	Brazilian Association of Dentistry
APAS	Pracatum Association for Social Action
APCS	Association to Support Training with Solidarity
AMFOGO	Fonte do Governo Neighborhood Association
CDI	Committee for the Democratization of Information Technology
CODEFAT	Board of Directors of the Fund for Workers' Assistance
Conder	Bahia State Urban Development Company
EDP	Economic Development Plan
Embasa	Bahia Water and Sewage Utility Company
FAT	Fund for Workers' Assistance
LDP	Local Development Plan
SEBRAE	Brazilian Service to Support Small and Medium-Size Companies
SEPLANTEC	Bahia State Secretariat of Planning and Technology
UEC	English Course, City of Salvador
Unipaz	International Holistic University
UFBA	Federal University of Bahia
CAIXA	Federal Savings Bank
GED	General Educational Development

APPENDIX II Project Identification Card

Identification of the Best Practice

Name of the Best Practice	"Tá Rebocado" Community Development Program
Location	Low-income community named Candeal, located in the borough of Brotas in city of Salvador, capital of the State of Bahia in Northeast Brazil.
Overall Objective	To encourage, develop, and guarantee community participation in the organization process in Candeal, with a view towards the neighborhood's economic, social, and cultural development and the resulting empowerment and social inclusion of its residents.
Specific Objectives	<p>To improve housing conditions and promote urbanization of the area.</p> <p>To promote educational and cultural processes aimed at valuing local culture and increasing the potential for exercising citizenship.</p> <p>To promote activities to facilitate employment and income generation in the area.</p> <p>To promote actions related to health and environmental protection and preservation.</p> <p>To promote actions aimed at empowering community institutions and increasing the degree of residents' mobilization.</p>

Institution responsible for the Best Practice

Pracatum Association for Social Action, a nongovernmental, non-profit organization funded in 1994 at the initiative of musician Carlinhos Brown, with its headquarters on Rua Paulo Afonso in Candeal Pequeno de Brotas, Salvador, Bahia, Brazil.

Partner institutions		
Federal Institutions	Caixa Econômica Federal (CAIXA)	Financial and technical
State Institutions	Government of the State of Bahia: CONDER	Financial and technical
	Government of the State of Bahia: EMBASA	Technical
Municipal Institutions	Salvador Municipality	Technical
Civil Society	Grassroots community associations: Nove de Outubro Neighborhood Association, Defesa e Progresso Neighborhood Association, Fonte do Governo Neighborhood Association (AMFOGO).	Political
Other Partnerships	SEBRAE	Technical
	UNIPAZ	Technical
	Association to Support Training with Solidarity (APCS)	Technical
	Committee for the Democratization of Information Technology (CDI)	Financial and technical
	UEC (English course)	Technical

Components and summary of the actions planned by the project/partner institutions		
AREAS	COMPONENTS / ACTIONS	PARTNER INSTITUTIONS
Housing / Urban Renewal and Infrastructure	Construction of new housing units. Improvements on existing housing units.	CAIXA/CONDER
	Expansion of water supply system to new housing reallocation areas and technical adjustments on existing system.	CAIXA/CONDER EMBASA
	Inspection of sewage system installed by the Bahia Azul Program.	State Government EMBASA
	Improvement and expansion of storm sewer system.	State Government
	Expansion of garbage collection routes and educational campaigns on new forms of community solid waste management.	Salvador Municipality
	Expansion of public lighting.	State Government Salvador Municipality
	Recovery of street system, paving, widening of stretches to allow for two-way motor vehicle traffic.	State Government CAIXA
	Recovery of the Bica spring.	CAIXA/CONDER
	Construction of community equipment -Health Post; Community fountains; Children's Center; Fonte do Governo Community Garden; Candeal Cultural and Trade Center.	CAIXA/CONDER
Renovation of headquarters for the Nove de Outubro and Defesa e Progresso Neighborhood Associations, construction of headquarters for the Fonte do Governo Neighborhood Association (AMFOGO)	CAIXA/CONDER	

Components and summary of the actions planned by the project/partner institutions (continuation)

AREAS	COMPONENTS / ACTIONS	PARTNER INSTITUTIONS
Education and Culture	Construction of Children's Center – daycare center/school for children from 4 months to 14 years	–
	Construction of semi-industrial production centers focused on the cultural and entertainment industry, recording, and manufacturing of props.	–
	Construction of points of sale and distribution for products from the above centers.	CAIXA
	Adult literacy courses for residents of Candéal and other low-income communities.	CAIXA/CONDER
	Implementation of the Art-Education Project	CAIXA/CONDER
	Dissemination of environmental education as an instrument for awareness-raising and optimization of infrastructure and urban renewal construction work.	CONDER
Employment Income	Supply of vocational training courses.	CODEFAT/Associations UFBA/ABO/CONDER/ CDI
	Workshops to promote local production.	CAIXA / State Government
Health	Development of educational activities related to preventive health measures.	CONDER/UFBA/ABO
Community Organization	Establishment of Community Assemblies.	Associações e lideranças comunitárias
	Participation by neighborhood associations in the provision of socio-educational services.	CDI/UEC
	Legal aid.	CONDER

**Funds budgeted and disbursed
– percentage of funds by institutions –**

YEAR	US \$ (DOLLARS)	%	CAIXA	%	STATE	%	APAS	%
1999	1,458,145.56	70,18	1,312,331.00	89,62	145,814.56	25,14	–	0
2000	15,280.39	0,78	–	0	–	0	15,280.39	48,39
2001	470,647.98	29,04	118,508.48	10,38	338,595.67	74,86	13,543.83	51,61
TOTAL	1,944,073.93	100,00	1,430,839.48	100,00	484,410.23	100,00	28,824.22	100,00

Source: Guidelines Manual for Replication of Local Management Best Practices

Funds budgeted and disbursed – percentage of funds by institution and year –								
YEAR	US\$ DOLLARS	CAIXA	%	STATE	%	APAS	%	TOTAL
1999	1,458,145.56	1,312,331.00	90,00	145,814.56	10,00	–	0	100,00
2000	15,280.39	–	0	–	0	15,280.39	100,00	100,00
2001	470,647.98	118,508.48	25,18	338,595.67	71,94	13,543.83	2,88	100,00
TOTAL	1,944,073.93	1,430,839.48	70,47	484,410.23	27,91	28,824.22	1,62	100,00

Source: Guidelines Manual for Replication of Local Management Best Practices

APPENDIX III Methodology

The methodology used in this Case Study was based on the premise that studies aimed at understanding and analyzing various dimensions in a given reality are indispensable to the success of the evaluation task. In this sense, since the Study's aim was to evaluate a multi-sectoral Project that is currently under way, one can begin by saying that the process itself of approaching the object contributed to the development of the method employed. The identification and internalization of several multi-dimensional and strategic analytical variables, prioritized on their own merit and on the fact that they are common to other projects in the CAIXA "Best Practices" Program, thus constituted a first resource for the team and for orienting the development of the subsequent steps.

To observe these variables, which correspond to the names of the chapters in this report, two stages were important in the course of the evaluation process and in successive approaches to the object of study: 1) consultation of secondary sources (the first approach to the object), carried out throughout the entire investigation, given both their importance and the difficulty in obtaining material prior to the field research and 2) the investigation of primary sources or the field research per se (the second approach to the object).

The research into secondary sources prioritized the identification formats adopted for the contest held by CAIXA (an *ex-ante* evaluation of the Project: objectives, results, impacts, and externalities), the "Tá Rebocado" Project reference document; the monthly reports submitted by Pracatum (from July 2000 to August 2001 and from January-February and September-December 2002); the documents on strategic planning carried out by the institution and the projects that are still in the pipeline; and the participatory diagnosis and business census produced by SEBRAE. These were all the evaluation documents available on the "Tá Rebocado" activities, and the primary sources thus provided most of the information presented in this Case Study.

The field research, whose importance lies in the latent possibility of systemic observation of the built-up space and relations established under the Project's influence, took place from January 20 to 24, 2003, conducted by a researcher graduated in Social Sciences with a master's degree in Political Science. The short time frame for conducting the field visits (considering the Project's magnitude and diversity of actions) did not jeopardize the task of "observing the space" mentioned above, because outlines had been elaborated ahead of time with the previously mentioned strategic variables, along with the choice of research techniques, which allowed for the optimization of time in the field.

The field visits were conducted without any intervention by the Pracatum team, thus leaving the interviewees at ease during the interviews (although the

Pracatum team had helped set up contacts in the neighborhood). CAIXA also provided indispensable support, ceding one of its employees to help make the initial contacts with Candéal residents and set up the field research team.

In addition to the technique of systematic observation of the milieu, in-depth interviews and focus groups constituted the methodology for this stage. In-depth interviews¹⁴, crucial for the identification and analysis of the residents' perception concerning the Project implementation process and its effects on the physical and social environment, were prioritized for contact with the institutions that formulate, promote, and finance the "Tá Rebocado" Project and were used with key community leaders and presidents of neighborhood associations. This prioritization was based on the significant role played by these institutions and individuals in relation to potential transferability of the experience. A total of 22 individual interviews were held.

For contact with other residents and members of specific groups resulting from the Project's implementation, the focus group technique was used¹⁵. The four focus groups (facilitated by the residents' receptiveness and the aid of the CAIXA employee) were based on oral testimony.

Thus, the evaluation process drew on data and information furnished by part of the Project managers (both external and internal), local stakeholders, and the beneficiaries /participants in the experience. The understanding of the testimony by different public and private stakeholders situated in different positions in the Project's internal setting and in the political, economic, and social scenario itself was extremely important for producing the report presented here.

By way of illustration, the following is a schematic representation of the methodological stages described thus far.

Stages and steps in approaching the research process

1st STAGE Review of secondary sources

- Knowledge and analysis of the original Project: view of the reality prior to the Project and forecasted changes – goals, results, and impacts – as a result of implementing the Practice.
- Knowledge and analysis of the process of negotiating partnerships and the resources initially planned for implementing the Project.
- Knowledge and analysis of the Project's follow-up and progress reports / Identification of the difficulties involved in the implementation process.

¹⁴Open interviews and interviews with predefined questionnaires based on the characteristics of the interviewee's activity.

¹⁵Meetings conducted towards a debate focused on the specific action of the respective group.

2nd STAGE
Field Research,
with Primary Sources

- Establishment of contacts and knowledge concerning the opinions of managers, partners, and community leaders towards the Practice, its results, the difficulties faced and the strategies used to overcome them.
- Establishment of contacts with the beneficiary public and knowledge of their opinions concerning the Practice and its results and impacts.
- Systemic observation of the residents' space and conviviality.

To carry out the evaluation process *stricto sensu*, oriented by the above-mentioned methodological design and especially the strategic variables indicated in the Term of Reference (i.e., the role and performance of the partner institutions, the environmental, cultural, financial, and institutional sustainability of the Practice, its contribution to social inclusion, especially from the gender perspective, and the empowerment of community organization), the following "overall indicators" or issues were at the center of the evaluation:

- Existing channels for dialogue among the partner institutions, and their responsibilities and roles;
- A significant contribution to the efficient and effective use of mobilized and available social, cultural, economic, and environmental resources;
- The degree of involvement by community members during the Project implementation process (formal or informal involvement, participation in the identification of demands, definition of actions, follow-up and monitoring of same, interim evaluation of results, (re)planning of activities timetable, negotiation with other agencies involved in the Practice, etc.);
- Evidence related to formal and alleged guarantees of continuity of the Practice over time and the creation of conditions for self-management of spin-offs from the initiative in the area; and
- Specificities linked to the Practice to support strategies for its transferability.

The analysis of the facts and information gathered from these questions, and the resulting conclusions, although partial, brought the initial research trajectory to conclusion and guaranteed the unity in the proposed methodology.

The following is a list of the interviews and focus groups, organized so as to allow immediate identification of the individuals' various institutions or representation.

APPENDIX IV

Interviewees by institutional identification / Focus Groups

In-depth interviews	
INSTITUTION / REPRESENTATION	LIST OF INTERVIEWEES BY FUNCTION
Pracatum	<p>Caius Brandão – executive director of the institution</p> <p>Patricia Marquesine – director of the "Tá Rebocado" Project</p> <p>Selma – director of the Music School</p> <p>Pedro Luís – community link/representative of Youth Group /member of the "Tá Rebocado" team</p> <p>Andréa – member of the "Tá Rebocado" team/ Candeal resident</p> <p>Sinara – teacher in the adult literacy course /member of the "Tá Rebocado" team</p> <p>Claudete – member of the Governing Council of Pracatum</p> <p>Vera Lyra – first executive director of Pracatum/ responsible for having designed the "Tá Rebocado" Project and the Music Training School</p>
Caixa Econômica Federal	<p>Beatriz Cerqueira Lima – Manager of Urban Development</p> <p>Thelma Catarina Cavalcante Pires – Supervisor of Public Sector</p>
CONDER	<p>Dr. Mário Gordilho – president</p> <p>Ana Carla – social worker</p>
SEBRAE	<p>Ilane – staff member of the Project's executive agency</p> <p>Kátia – staff member of the Project's executive agency</p> <p>Adriana – representative of the Local Development Department, SEBRAE, Salvador Office.</p>
Defesa e Progresso Neighborhood Association	<p>Arinalva (Tita) – president of the association</p>
Nove de Outubro Neighborhood Association	<p>Graciete (Ciete) – president of the association</p>
Fonte do Governo Neighborhood Association (AMFOGO)	<p>Nilton – president of the association</p>
Community Leaders	<p>Raimundo – resident of Fonte do Governo</p> <p>Nelcy – resident of Candeal Pequeno</p>
Community Residents	<p>Leila – resident of the Jardim Candeal housing project/ built by the "Tá Rebocado" Project</p> <p>Dona Branca – resident of Candeal Pequeno</p>
Total no. of interviews	22

Focus groups and/or collective interviews

REPRESENTATION	LIST OF PARTICIPANTS / TOPICS	OBSERVATIONS
Residents	<p>Participants: Júlio, Liberato, Nito, Genivaldo, Guto, Raimundo, Aldir, Graça.</p> <p>Topics: level of community organization; relationship between residents and Pracatum and its programs, evaluation of the activities carried out in Candeal, survey of expectations.</p>	<p>Total number of participants: 8</p> <p>The group composition was based on the contacts made by the researcher herself in the area, in order for the resulting information to be added to that derived from interviewees named by Pracatum itself.</p>
Women's group	<p>Participants: Miralva, Andréa, and Teresinha (leader from Carmelo).</p> <p>Topics: level of community organization; relationship between residents and Pracatum and its programs, evaluation of the activities carried out in Candeal.</p>	<p>Total number of participants: 3 women</p> <p>The group was set up at the initiative of Pracatum and consisted of women with activities related to the programs developed by the institution.</p>
"Candeal Presente" / Management Group	<p>Participants: Marinalva, Carminha, Berna, Fernando.</p> <p>Topics: organization and functionality of groups; activities carried out; relationship between the groups and the community and Pracatum; evaluation of the "Tá Rebocado" Project.</p>	<p>Total number of participants: 4</p> <p>The group was originally scheduled to discuss the work by "Candeal Presente". Due to the presence of a member of the Management Group and the fact that two women also belonged to it, the issues dealt with were expanded.</p>
Group of students from literacy course	<p>Topics: evaluation of the course (process and results); relationship with the "Tá Rebocado" Project and with Pracatum;</p>	<p>Total number of participants: 10 (8 of whom were women)</p> <p>Age range: from 21 to 72 years</p>
Total number of individuals contacted by the two techniques: 47 (33 women and 14 men)		

APPENDIX V Photograph Report



Lactomia Band plays instruments
manufactured with recyclable materials



Community before the urbanization
improvements



Community residents employed on an
engineering site



Candeal's restored water fountain



Community after the urbanization
improvements



Façades embellished by the community